### **Probabilistic Programming** Lecture #5: Domain Theory

Joost-Pieter Katoen



#### RWTH Lecture Series on Probabilistic Programming 2018

#### **Overview**

1 Motivation

2 Complete lattices

3 Monotonic and continuous functions

Fixpoint theorems

### Aims and sufficient conditions

- In denotational program semantics, the semantics of a loop is defined as some fixed point of a mathematical function
  - We will consider this for pGCL

$$-f(x) = x$$

### Aims and sufficient conditions

- In denotational program semantics, the semantics of a loop is defined as some fixed point of a mathematical function
  - We will consider this for pGCL

$$f(x) = x$$

#### Goals:

- Prove existence of such fixed points
- Show how they can be "computed" (more exactly: approximated)

### Aims and sufficient conditions

In denotational program semantics, the semantics of a loop is defined as some fixed point of a mathematical function

We will consider this for pGCL

#### Goals:

- Prove existence of such fixed points
- Show how they can be "computed" (more exactly: approximated)
- Sufficient conditions:



- on function domains: complete lattices
- on functions: monotonicity and Scott continuity

#### **Overview**





3 Monotonic and continuous functions

#### Fixpoint theorems

#### Partial order

A partial order (PO)  $(D, \subseteq)$  consists of a set D, called domain, and of a relation  $\subseteq \subseteq D \times D$  such that, for every  $d_1, d_2, d_3 \in D$ :

A PO is called total if, in addition, always  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  or  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1$ .



#### Partial order

A partial order (PO)  $(D, \subseteq)$  consists of a set D, called domain, and of a relation  $\subseteq \subseteq D \times D$  such that, for every  $d_1, d_2, d_3 \in D$ :

A PO is called total if, in addition, always  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  or  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1$ .

#### Examples

1. ( $\mathbb{N}$ ,  $\leq$ ) is a total partial order

#### Partial order

A partial order (PO)  $(D, \subseteq)$  consists of a set D, called domain, and of a relation  $\subseteq \subseteq D \times D$  such that, for every  $d_1, d_2, d_3 \in D$ :

$$d_1 \subseteq d_1$$
(reflexivity) $d_1 \subseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \subseteq d_3 \implies d_1 \subseteq d_3$ (transitivity) $d_1 \subseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \subseteq d_1 \implies d_1 = d_2$ (antisymmetry)

A PO is called total if, in addition, always  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  or  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1$ .

#### Examples

1. (
$$\mathbb{N}$$
, ≤) is a total partial order  
2. (2 <sup>$\mathbb{N}$</sup> , ⊆) is a (non-total) partial order

#### Partial order

A partial order (PO)  $(D, \subseteq)$  consists of a set D, called domain, and of a relation  $\subseteq \subseteq D \times D$  such that, for every  $d_1, d_2, d_3 \in D$ :

$$d_1 \subseteq d_1$$
(reflexivity) $d_1 \subseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \subseteq d_3 \implies d_1 \subseteq d_3$ (transitivity) $d_1 \subseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \subseteq d_1 \implies d_1 = d_2$ (antisymmetry)

A PO is called total if, in addition, always  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  or  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1$ .

#### Examples

- 1. ( $\mathbb{N}$ ,  $\leq$ ) is a total partial order
- 2.  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  is a (non-total) partial order
- 3. ( $\mathbb{N}$ , <) is not a partial order (since not reflexive)

### Upper and lower bounds

#### Upper bound

An element  $d \in D$  is called an upper bound of  $S \subseteq D$  denoted  $S \sqsubseteq d$ , if  $s \sqsubseteq d$  for every  $s \in S$ .



### Upper and lower bounds

#### Upper bound

An element  $d \in D$  is called an upper bound of  $S \subseteq D$ , denoted  $S \sqsubseteq d$ , if  $s \sqsubseteq d$  for every  $s \in S$ .

An upper bound d of  $S \subseteq D$  is called least upper bound (LUB) or supremum of S, denoted  $d = \bigsqcup S$ , if  $d \sqsubseteq d'$  for every upper bound d' of S.



### Upper and lower bounds

#### Upper bound

An element  $d \in D$  is called an upper bound of  $S \subseteq D$ , denoted  $S \sqsubseteq d$ , if  $s \sqsubseteq d$  for every  $s \in S$ .

An upper bound d of  $S \subseteq D$  is called least upper bound (LUB) or supremum of S, denoted  $d = \bigsqcup S$ , if  $d \sqsubseteq d'$  for every upper bound d' of S.

#### Lower bound

An element  $d \in D$  is called a lower bound of  $S \subseteq D$ , denoted  $d \subseteq S$ , if  $d \subseteq s$  for every  $s \in S$ .

## Upper and lower bounds

$$\langle 2^{N}, \subseteq \rangle S [1, 2, 3, 4], \{2, 4]$$
  
glb (s) =  $\{2, 4\}$ 

#### Upper bound

An element  $d \in D$  is called an upper bound of  $S \subseteq D$ , denoted  $S \sqsubseteq d$ , if  $s \sqsubseteq d$  for every  $s \in S$ .

An upper bound *d* of  $S \subseteq D$  is called least upper bound (LUB) or supremum of *S*, denoted  $d = \bigsqcup S$ , if  $d \sqsubseteq d'$  for every upper bound *d'* of *S*.

#### Lower bound

An element  $d \in D$  is called a lower bound of  $S \subseteq D$ , denoted  $d \sqsubseteq S$ , if  $d \sqsubseteq s$  for every  $s \in S$ .

A lower bound d of  $S \subseteq D$  is called greatest lower bound (GLB) or infimum of S, denoted  $d = \prod S$ , if  $d' \subseteq d$  for every lower bound d' of S.

#### Chains

#### Chains

 $S \subseteq D$  is called a chain in D if, for every  $s_1, s_2 \in S$ ,

 $s_1 \sqsubseteq s_2$  or  $s_2 \sqsubseteq s_1$ .

That is, S is a totally ordered subset of D.

#### Chains

#### Chains

 $S \subseteq D$  is called a chain in D if, for every  $s_1, s_2 \in S$ ,

 $s_1 \sqsubseteq s_2$  or  $s_2 \sqsubseteq s_1$ .

That is, *S* is a totally ordered subset of *D*. A chain  $S = s_1 \sqsubseteq s_2 \sqsubseteq s_3 \sqsubseteq \dots$  is a ascending. A chain  $S = s_1 \sqsupseteq s_2 \sqsupseteq s_3 \sqsupseteq \dots$  is a descending.

### **Examples: chains**

Every subset S ⊆ N is a chain in (N, ≤).
 It has a LUB (its greatest element) iff it is finite.

### **Examples: chains**

 Every subset S ⊆ N is a chain in (N, ≤). It has a LUB (its greatest element) iff it is finite.
 {Ø, {0}, {0,1},...} is a chain in (2<sup>N</sup>, ⊆) with LUB N.

#### **Complete lattice**

# A PO $(D, \sqsubseteq)$ is called a complete lattice, if every subset $S \subseteq D$ has a supremum in D, i.e., $\bigsqcup S \in D$ .

#### **Complete lattice**

A PO  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  is called a complete lattice, if every subset  $S \subseteq D$  has a supremum in D, i.e.,  $\bigsqcup S \in D$ .

Every complete lattice  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  has a least element  $\bot$  and, dually, a greatest element  $\top$  which satisfy:

 $\forall d \in D. \quad \bot \sqsubseteq d \sqsubseteq \top .$ 

by definition 
$$\not Q \subseteq D$$
  
by definition every deD is an upper bound of  $\not Q$   
thus  $\bigsqcup \varphi$  exists and is the least elt  $\bot$   
of  $(D, \Xi)$ 

#### **Complete lattice**

A PO  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  is called a complete lattice, if every subset  $S \subseteq D$  has a supremum in D, i.e.,  $\bigsqcup S \in D$ .

Every complete lattice  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  has a least element  $\bot$  and, dually, a greatest element  $\top$  which satisfy:

$$\forall d \in D. \quad \bot \sqsubseteq d \sqsubseteq \top .$$

#### Ð

 $\square$  complete lattice (*D*,  $\sqsubseteq$ ): every subset *S* ⊆ *D* has an infimum in *D*, i.e.,  $\square S \in D$ .

Every ascending or descending chain has a least upper bound and greatest lower bound.

Joost-Pieter Katoen



### **Examples:** lattices

1.  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  is a complete lattice with  $\bigsqcup S = \bigcup_{M \in S} M$  for every subset  $S \subseteq 2^{\mathbb{N}}$ .

### **Examples:** lattices

- 1.  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  is a complete lattice with  $\bigsqcup S = \bigcup_{M \in S} M$  for every subset  $S \subseteq 2^{\mathbb{N}}$ .
- 2. ( $\mathbb{N}, \leq$ ) is not a complete lattice, as, e.g., the chain  $\mathbb{N}$  has no upper bound.

### **Examples:** lattices

- 1.  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  is a complete lattice with  $\bigsqcup S = \bigcup_{M \in S} M$  for every subset  $S \subseteq 2^{\mathbb{N}}$ .
- 2. ( $\mathbb{N}, \leq$ ) is not a complete lattice, as, e.g., the chain  $\mathbb{N}$  has no upper bound.
- 3. Which of the following structures are complete lattices?





### **Overview**





3 Monotonic and continuous functions

#### Fixpoint theorems

#### Monotonicity

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  and  $(D', \sqsubseteq')$  be partial orders, and let  $F : D \to D'$ . F is called monotonic (w.r.t.  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  and  $(D', \sqsubseteq')$ ) if, for every  $d_1, d_2 \in D$ ,

 $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  implies  $F(d_1) \sqsubseteq' F(d_2)$ .

#### Monotonicity

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  and  $(D', \sqsubseteq')$  be partial orders, and let  $F : D \to D'$ . F is called monotonic (w.r.t.  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  and  $(D', \sqsubseteq')$ ) if, for every  $d_1, d_2 \in D$ ,

$$d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$$
 implies  $F(d_1) \sqsubseteq' F(d_2)$ .

#### Interpretation: monotonic functions preserve information

#### Monotonicity

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  and  $(D', \sqsubseteq')$  be partial orders, and let  $F : D \to D'$ . F is called monotonic (w.r.t.  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  and  $(D', \sqsubseteq')$ ) if, for every  $d_1, d_2 \in D$ ,

$$d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$$
 implies  $F(d_1) \sqsubseteq' F(d_2)$ .

#### Interpretation: monotonic functions preserve information

1. Let  $T := \{S \subseteq \mathbb{N} \mid S \text{ finite}\}$ . Then  $F_1 : T \to \mathbb{N} : S \mapsto \sum_{n \in S} n$  is monotonic w.r.t.  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  and  $(\mathbb{N}, \leqslant)$ .  $T_{=} \quad \begin{array}{l} 22, 27, 301 \end{array}$   $F_1 = \quad 2+27+301 \end{array}$ 

#### Monotonicity

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  and  $(D', \sqsubseteq')$  be partial orders, and let  $F : D \rightarrow D'$ . F is called monotonic (w.r.t.  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  and  $(D', \sqsubseteq')$ ) if, for every  $d_1, d_2 \in D$ ,

$$d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$$
 implies  $F(d_1) \sqsubseteq' F(d_2)$ .

#### Interpretation: monotonic functions preserve information

### Monotonicity on chains

The following lemma states how chains behave under monotonic functions.

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  and  $(D', \sqsubseteq')$  be complete lattices,  $F : D \rightarrow D'$  monotonic, and  $S \subseteq D$  a chain in D. Then: 1.  $F(S) := \{F(d) \mid d \in S\}$  is a chain in D'. 2.  $||F(S) \sqsubseteq' F(||S)$ .



### Monotonicity on chains

The following lemma states how chains behave under monotonic functions.

Let 
$$(D, \sqsubseteq)$$
 and  $(D', \sqsubseteq')$  be complete lattices,  $F : D \to D'$  monotonic, and  $S \subseteq D$  a chain in  $D$ . Then:  
1.  $F(S) \coloneqq \{F(d) \mid d \in S\}$  is a chain in  $D'$ .  
2.  $\bigsqcup F(S) \sqsubseteq' F(\bigsqcup S)$ .

#### Proof.

Left as a homework exercise.

A function F is continuous if applying F and taking LUBs is commutable:

A function F is continuous if applying F and taking LUBs is commutable:

#### Scott continuity

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  and  $(D', \sqsubseteq')$  be complete lattices and  $F : D \to D'$  monotonic. Then F is called continuous if, for every non-empty chain  $S \subseteq D$ ,

 $F\left(\bigsqcup S\right) = \bigsqcup F(S).$ 



A function F is continuous if applying F and taking LUBs is commutable:

#### Scott continuity

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  and  $(D', \sqsubseteq')$  be complete lattices and  $F : D \to D'$  monotonic. Then F is called continuous if, for every non-empty chain  $S \subseteq D$ ,

$$F\left(\bigsqcup S\right) = \bigsqcup F(S).$$

Every continuous function is monotonic.

A function F is continuous if applying F and taking LUBs is commutable:

#### Scott continuity

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  and  $(D', \sqsubseteq')$  be complete lattices and  $F : D \to D'$  monotonic. Then F is called continuous if, for every non-empty chain  $S \subseteq D$ ,

 $F\left(\bigsqcup S\right) = \bigsqcup F(S).$ 

Every continuous function is monotonic.

#### Proof.

- 1. Let  $d \subseteq e$ . Then  $\{d, e\}$  is a chain with  $\bigsqcup \{d, e\} = e$ .
- 2. Let F be continuous. Then  $F(d) \sqsubseteq \bigsqcup \{ F(d), F(e) \}$ .
- 3. By continuity of F,  $\{F(d), F(e)\} = F(\bigsqcup \{d, e\})$ , which equals F(d).

### **Overview**

Motivation f(x) = XComplete lattices Monotonic and continuous functions f(x) - x = 0

4 Fixpoint theorems

### **Fixed points**

#### **Fixed point**

Let  $F : D \to D$  be a function. Element  $d \in D$  is called a fixed point of F if and only if F(d) = d.

### **Fixed points**

#### **Fixed point**

Let  $F : D \to D$  be a function. Element  $d \in D$  is called a fixed point of F if and only if F(d) = d.

#### Examples

- 1. Function  $F : \mathbb{R} \to \mathbb{R}$  with  $F(x) = x^2 3x + 4$  has a fixed point at 2.
- 2. For function  $F : \mathbb{R} \to \mathbb{R}$  with F(x) = x, all  $x \in \mathbb{R}$  are fixed points.
- 3. Function  $F : \mathbb{R} \to \mathbb{R}$  with F(x) = x+4 has no fixed points.
- 4. Function  $F : \mathbb{R} \to \mathbb{R}$  with  $F(x) = \frac{x}{2} + \frac{1}{x}$  has a fixed point at  $\sqrt{2}$ .
- 5. Function  $F : \mathbb{R} \to \mathbb{R}$  with  $F(x) = \cos(x)$  has a fixed point, but this is hard to determine.

### How to find fixed points?

Naive scheme: start with an initial value  $x_0$ , and then iterate:  $x_{n+1} = f(x_n)$ .

### How to find fixed points?

Naive scheme: start with an initial value  $x_0$ , and then iterate:  $x_{n+1} = f(x_n)$ . (Wrong) idea: as *n* grows larger,  $x_n$  converges to some fixed point of *F*.

- 1. Take  $F(x) = \frac{x}{2} + \frac{1}{x}$  and  $x_0 = 1$ . Iterations yields:  $\frac{3}{2}, \frac{17}{12}, \frac{17}{24} + \frac{12}{17}$  which indeed approximates  $\sqrt{2}$ .
- 2. Take  $F(x) = \frac{5}{2}x \frac{3}{2}x^2$ . Iteration converges to 1.
- 3. But, take  $F(x) = \frac{13}{4}x \frac{3}{2}x^2$ . Iteration oscillates between two points, regardless of the initial value.

When does such an iterative scheme (i.e., approximate) a fixed point, and if so, which fixed point?

We consider this for complete lattices and continuous functions.

### Iterative scheme to determine a fixed point



### Kleene's fixpoint theorem

#### Kleene's fixpoint theorem

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  be a complete lattice and  $F : D \rightarrow D$  continuous. Then F has a least fixed point lfp F and greatest fixed point gfp F respectively, given by:

If 
$$F := \sup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} F^n(\bot)$$
 and  $\operatorname{gfp} F := \inf_{n \in \mathbb{N}} F^n(\top)$ 

where  $F^{0}(d) = d$  and  $F^{n+1}(d) = F(F^{n}(d))$ .





claim:

(b)  $X = \bigcup F^{n}(I)$  is the least fixed point



- It follows (by induction on n)
  - that  $P^{n}(L) \equiv Y \quad \forall n$ .
- Since every element of the chain
  - $F^{\circ}(L) \subseteq F^{\prime}(L) \subseteq F^{2}(L) \subseteq \dots$
- is a subset of Y we have

$$X = W P^{(1)} E Y$$

so X is the least fixed point B

### Kleene's fixpoint theorem

#### Kleene's fixpoint theorem

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  be a complete lattice and  $F : D \rightarrow D$  continuous. Then F has a least fixed point lfp F and greatest fixed point gfp F respectively, given by:

If 
$$F := \sup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} F^n(\bot)$$
 and gf  $F := \inf_{n \in \mathbb{N}} F^n(\top)$ 

where 
$$F^{0}(d) = d$$
 and  $F^{n+1}(d) = F(F^{n}(d))$ .

#### Proof.

on the board

### ▶ Domain: complete lattice $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$ with $\bigsqcup S = \bigcup_{N \in S} N$

- ▶ Domain: complete lattice  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  with  $\bigcup S = \bigcup_{N \in S} N$
- ▶ Function:  $F: 2^{\mathbb{N}} \to 2^{\mathbb{N}}: N \mapsto N \cup A$  for some fixed  $A \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ 
  - ► F monotonic:  $M \subseteq N \implies F(M) = M \cup A \subseteq N \cup A = F(N)$
  - ► F continuous:  $F(\bigsqcup S) = F(\bigcup_{N \in S} N) = (\bigcup_{N \in S} N) \cup A = \bigcup_{N \in S} (N \cup A) = \bigcup_{N \in S} F(N) = \bigsqcup F(S).$

▶ Domain: complete lattice  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  with  $\bigsqcup S = \bigcup_{N \in S} N$ 

- ▶ Function:  $F: 2^{\mathbb{N}} \to 2^{\mathbb{N}} : N \mapsto N \cup A$  for some fixed  $A \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ 
  - ► F monotonic:  $M \subseteq N \implies F(M) = M \cup A \subseteq N \cup A = F(N)$
  - ► F continuous:  $F(\bigsqcup S) = F(\bigcup_{N \in S} N) = (\bigcup_{N \in S} N) \cup A = \bigcup_{N \in S} (N \cup A) = \bigcup_{N \in S} F(N) = \bigsqcup F(S).$
- ► Fixpoint iteration:  $N_n := F^n(\bigcup \emptyset)$  where  $\bigcup \emptyset = \emptyset$   $\bot = \emptyset$

• 
$$N_0 = \bigsqcup \emptyset = \emptyset$$

$$\blacktriangleright N_1 = F(N_0) = \emptyset \cup A = A$$

•  $N_2 = F(N_1) = A \cup A = A = N_n$  for every  $n \ge 1$ 

$$\Rightarrow$$
 gfp  $F = A$ 



- ▶ Function:  $F: 2^{\mathbb{N}} \to 2^{\mathbb{N}}: N \mapsto N \cup A$  for some fixed  $A \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ 
  - ► F monotonic:  $M \subseteq N \implies F(M) = M \cup A \subseteq N \cup A = F(N)$
  - ► F continuous:  $F(\bigsqcup S) = F(\bigcup_{N \in S} N) = (\bigcup_{N \in S} N) \cup A = \bigcup_{N \in S} (N \cup A) = \bigcup_{N \in S} F(N) = \bigsqcup F(S).$

► Fixpoint iteration:  $N_n := F^n(\bigcup \emptyset)$  where  $\bigcup \emptyset = \emptyset$ 

• 
$$N_0 = \bigsqcup \emptyset = \emptyset$$

$$\blacktriangleright N_1 = F(N_0) = \emptyset \cup A = A$$

► 
$$N_2 = F(N_1) = A \cup A = A = N_n$$
 for every  $n \ge 1$ 

$$\Rightarrow$$
 gfp  $F = A$ 

• Alternatively: 
$$F(N) = N \cap A$$
  
 $\Rightarrow$  gfp  $F = \emptyset$ 

Probabilistic Programming

Fixpoint theorems

## Knaster-Tarski theorem (1)

Alfred Tarski (1901-1983)



Bronislaw Knaster (1893–1990)



#### Prefixed point and postfixed point

For monotonic function  $F: D \rightarrow D$  on  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  and  $d \in D$ :

- 1. *d* is a prefixed point of *F* if  $F(d) \subseteq d$
- 2. d is a postfixed point of F if  $d \subseteq F(d)$ .

d is a prefixed and a postfixed point of F iff d is a fixed point.

### Knaster-Tarski theorem (2) Fis monatonic Knaster-Tarski theorem For any complete lattice $(D, \subseteq)$ the following holds: 1. The least fixed and the prefixed points of F exist, and are identical 2. The greatest fixed and the postfixed points of F exist, and are <sup>T</sup> greatest identical 11 3. The fixed points of F form a complete lattice.

#### Proof.

On the black board.

### Pictorial depiction of the Knaster-Tarski theorem



(D, E) is a complete lattice Proof F: D >> D monotonic let pre be the set of prefixed points of F (1)let (p be the glb = inf pre.) p does exist as we deal with complete lattices. <u>Claim</u>: p is the least prefixed let x ∈ pre. point of F, and p is the lip a.  $p \sqsubseteq x$  (\* as p = inf pre \*)=> F(p) E F(x) (\* as Fis monotonic (\* as XE pre \*)  $\Rightarrow$   $F(p) \sqsubseteq x$ =) (\* as X E pre is arbitrary, it follows that F(p) is a Lb of pre; now as p = glb pre +)  $F(p) \subseteq p$ =) (+ thus by definition p E pre; in addition p is a lb of pre \*) p is the least prefixed point of F

b. p is the Lfp F:



(3) The fixed points of F form a complete lattice. let W be a subset of fixed points of F  $W_{q} = q^{1}$ 2 Fixed points of F Show: existence of sup W. let g = UW. let  $gf = \frac{1}{2} \cup \frac{1}{2} \subseteq \frac{1}{2}$ Then ge gt, and by def. of gt, g = inf gt (a) 91 is a complete lattice (b) F maps g1 onto g1 (\* monotonicity 2) (c) F is a mapping over (ig1, ⊑) complete ⇒ g is glb of g1 / م للم رو

proofs of (a) through (c) (a) claim: qT is a complete lattice. Proof: as gt EW and Wis a complete lattice, inf gt and sup gt exist and lie in W We have q = inf qt and q eqt, thus inf g1 e g. Furthermore, since g e g1, q E sup q1. By definition of q1, we have sup gt e gt. (b) claim: Fmaps g1 to g1. Let we w and  $x \in q1$ . To show:  $F(x) \in q1$ . We have: W Eq and q Ex  $\implies (* \text{ monotonicity of } F; \text{ bransibivity of } \underbrace{=}{*})$  $F(\omega) \subseteq F(x)$ => (\* W is a set of fixed points of F \*)  $w \subseteq F(x)$ =) (\* w is an arbitrary elk of w \*) Sup W E F(x) (\* 9= sup W \*)  $\Rightarrow 9 \subseteq F(x) \Rightarrow F(x) \in 9^{\uparrow}.$ 

