

Table 1: Results for parametric reachability and parametric expected rewards.

|              |          | type     | #states | #trans  | PRISM |                   | PARAM |                    | PROPhESY |                  |
|--------------|----------|----------|---------|---------|-------|-------------------|-------|--------------------|----------|------------------|
|              |          |          |         |         | verif | total             | verif | total              | verif    | total            |
| reachability | brp      | (128, 2) | 5381    | 6915    | 19    | 21 <sup>b</sup>   | 2     | 2 <sup>a</sup>     | < 1      | 1 <sup>g</sup>   |
|              |          | (128, 5) | 10376   | 13827   | 215   | 218 <sup>f</sup>  | 7     | 7 <sup>j</sup>     | 2        | 3 <sup>k</sup>   |
|              |          | (256, 2) | 10757   | 13827   | 119   | 123 <sup>b</sup>  | 7     | 8 <sup>a</sup>     | 1        | 2 <sup>g</sup>   |
|              |          | (256, 5) | 20744   | 27651   | 1237  | 1242 <sup>f</sup> | 32    | 33 <sup>j</sup>    | 8        | 10 <sup>k</sup>  |
|              |          | (5, 5)   | 8653    | 14953   | 4     | 7 <sup>i</sup>    | < 1*  | 1* <sup>j</sup>    | < 1      | 1 <sup>e</sup>   |
|              | crowds   | (10, 5)  | 111294  | 261444  | 257   | 265 <sup>d</sup>  | 3*    | 8* <sup>j</sup>    | < 1      | 9 <sup>j</sup>   |
|              |          | (15, 5)  | 592060  | 1754860 | TO    | TO                | 18*   | 48* <sup>j</sup>   | 1        | 46 <sup>g</sup>  |
|              |          | (20, 5)  | 2061951 | 7374951 | TO    | TO                | 75*   | 194* <sup>j</sup>  | 4        | 165 <sup>f</sup> |
|              |          | (10, 2)  | 14322   | 21567   | 19    | 23 <sup>k</sup>   | 2     | 2 <sup>c</sup>     | 1        | 2 <sup>f</sup>   |
| exp. rewards | nand     | (10, 5)  | 35112   | 52647   | 67    | 73 <sup>k</sup>   | 9     | 10 <sup>c</sup>    | 3        | 5 <sup>g</sup>   |
|              |          | (20, 2)  | 154942  | 239832  | 886   | 901 <sup>k</sup>  | 44    | 48 <sup>k</sup>    | 16       | 22 <sup>f</sup>  |
|              |          | (20, 5)  | 384772  | 594792  | TO    | TO                | 319   | 328 <sup>k</sup>   | 89       | 104 <sup>g</sup> |
|              |          | (5, 2)   | 33790   | 34813   | 3     | 7 <sup>b</sup>    | —*    | —*                 | < 1      | 2 <sup>g</sup>   |
|              | egl      | (5, 4)   | 74750   | 75773   | 5     | 11 <sup>c</sup>   | —*    | —*                 | < 1      | 5 <sup>f</sup>   |
|              |          | (8, 2)   | 3342334 | 3407869 | 194   | 345 <sup>b</sup>  | —     | —                  | 3        | 269 <sup>f</sup> |
|              |          | (8, 4)   | 7536638 | 7602173 | 543   | 910 <sup>c</sup>  | —     | —                  | 10       | 612 <sup>b</sup> |
|              |          | (10, 2)  | 14322   | 21567   | 39    | 43 <sup>b</sup>   | 12    | 14 <sup>g</sup>    | < 1      | 1 <sup>b</sup>   |
|              | zeroconf | (10, 5)  | 35112   | 52647   | 259   | 264 <sup>c</sup>  | 78    | 93 <sup>g</sup>    | 2        | 4 <sup>f</sup>   |
|              |          | (20, 2)  | 154942  | 239832  | TO    | TO                | 1325  | 2033 <sup>g</sup>  | 5        | 12 <sup>b</sup>  |
|              |          | (20, 5)  | 384772  | 594792  | TO    | TO                | TO    | TO                 | 47       | 64 <sup>f</sup>  |
|              |          | (1000)   | 1004    | 2005    | 472   | 474 <sup>j</sup>  | 2961  | 2962* <sup>c</sup> | < 1      | < 1 <sup>d</sup> |
|              |          | (10000)  | 10004   | 20005   | TO    | TO                | TO*   | TO*                | 4        | 4 <sup>c</sup>   |
|              |          | (100000) | 100004  | 200005  | TO    | TO                | TO*   | TO*                | 255      | 263 <sup>g</sup> |

The entries marked with an asterisk (\*) indicate that PARAM computed the incorrect result when using the optimal settings. We therefore list the times of the fastest setup that produced the correct result.

<sup>a</sup> best setup is: without bisimulation minimization, eliminate states in forward order

<sup>b</sup> best setup is: without bisimulation minimization, eliminate states in forward-reversed order

<sup>c</sup> best setup is: without bisimulation minimization, eliminate states in backward order

<sup>d</sup> best setup is: without bisimulation minimization, eliminate states in backward-reversed order

<sup>e</sup> best setup is: strong bisimulation minimization, eliminate states in forward order

<sup>f</sup> best setup is: strong bisimulation minimization, eliminate states in forward-reversed order

<sup>g</sup> best setup is: strong bisimulation minimization, eliminate states in backward order

<sup>h</sup> best setup is: strong bisimulation minimization, eliminate states in backward-reversed order

<sup>i</sup> best setup is: weak bisimulation minimization, eliminate states in forward order

<sup>j</sup> best setup is: weak bisimulation minimization, eliminate states in forward-reversed order

<sup>k</sup> best setup is: weak bisimulation minimization, eliminate states in backward order

<sup>l</sup> best setup is: weak bisimulation minimization, eliminate states in backward-reversed order

For details how to set these options in the tools, please see the text document “experiments.txt” on our website.

Table 2: Results for parametric conditional and numerical conditional experiments.

|                      |        | type       | #states | #trans  | PRISM |       | PARAM |       | PROPhESY |       | Baier et al. |       |
|----------------------|--------|------------|---------|---------|-------|-------|-------|-------|----------|-------|--------------|-------|
|                      |        |            |         |         | verif | total | verif | total | verif    | total | verif        | total |
| conditional          | crowds | (128, 2)   | 5381    | 6915    | —     | —     | —     | —     | < 1      | 1     | —            | —     |
|                      |        | (128, 5)   | 10376   | 13827   | —     | —     | —     | —     | < 1      | 1     | —            | —     |
|                      |        | (256, 2)   | 10757   | 13827   | —     | —     | —     | —     | < 1      | 1     | —            | —     |
|                      |        | (256, 5)   | 20744   | 27651   | —     | —     | —     | —     | 1        | 3     | —            | —     |
|                      |        | (10, 5, 1) | 111294  | 261444  | —     | —     | —     | —     | 1        | 9     | —            | —     |
|                      |        | (10, 5, 2) | 111294  | 261444  | —     | —     | —     | —     | 1        | 9     | —            | —     |
|                      |        | (15, 5, 1) | 592060  | 1754860 | —     | —     | —     | —     | 5        | 50    | —            | —     |
|                      |        | (15, 5, 2) | 592060  | 1754860 | —     | —     | —     | —     | 5        | 50    | —            | —     |
|                      |        | (20, 5, 1) | 2061951 | 7374951 | —     | —     | —     | —     | 14       | 174   | —            | —     |
|                      |        | (20, 5, 2) | 2061951 | 7374951 | —     | —     | —     | —     | 14       | 174   | —            | —     |
| conditional (double) | crowds | (5, 5, 1)  | 8653    | 14953   | —     | —     | —     | —     | < 1      | 1     | —            | —     |
|                      |        | (5, 5, 2)  | 8653    | 14953   | —     | —     | —     | —     | < 1      | 1     | —            | —     |
|                      |        | (128, 10)  | 18701   | 25347   | 8     | 11    | —     | —     | < 1      | < 1   | 54           | 58    |
|                      |        | (128, 2)   | 5381    | 6915    | 3     | 6     | —     | —     | < 1      | < 1   | 3            | 6     |
|                      |        | (128, 5)   | 10376   | 13827   | 5     | 8     | —     | —     | < 1      | < 1   | 11           | 14    |
|                      |        | (256, 10)  | 37389   | 50691   | 16    | 20    | —     | —     | < 1      | 1     | 325          | 328   |
|                      |        | (256, 2)   | 10757   | 13827   | 6     | 10    | —     | —     | < 1      | < 1   | 13           | 16    |
|                      |        | (256, 5)   | 20744   | 27651   | 10    | 14    | —     | —     | < 1      | < 1   | 65           | 69    |
|                      |        | (10, 5, 1) | 111294  | 261444  | 102   | 105   | —     | —     | < 1      | 1     | 10           | 15    |
|                      |        | (10, 5, 2) | 111294  | 261444  | 95    | 99    | —     | —     | < 1      | 1     | 11           | 16    |